

## Implementation of the Usmani Method in Learning the Qur'an for the Elderly at TPQ Khoirul Huda, Blitar Regency

Amirah Yasmin Khairunnisa\*, R Romelah, Ianatut Thoifah

Islamic Religious Education, Faculty of Islamic Studies, University of Muhammadiyah Malang, Indonesia

Corresponding Author: [amirahyasminkhairunnisa@gmail.com](mailto:amirahyasminkhairunnisa@gmail.com)

**Abstract.** This study aims to describe the Usmani method's implementation in teaching the elderly the Qur'an at TPQ Khoirul Huda, Blitar Regency, as well as the supporting and inhibiting factors. This study employed a case study design and a qualitative methodology. Ten elderly women and an ustadz as informants for the study, which was conducted at TPQ Khoirul Huda in the Blitar Regency. Techniques for observation, interviews, and documentation were used to gather data. The four processes of the Miles, Huberman, and Saldana model—data reduction, data presentation, data verification, and conclusion—were used to examine the data. The findings demonstrated that the Usmani method of teaching the Qur'an to the elderly at TPQ Khoirul Huda encompassed three stages: introductory activities that included conditioning the elderly, greetings, hadroh fatihah, prayer, and perception; core activities that aim to teach and instill concepts, understanding, and skills; and concluding activities that included greetings, prayer, and the delivery of moral lessons. The old's strong enthusiasm, the encouraging atmosphere, and the TPQ's advantageous location all contribute to the Usmani method of teaching the Qur'an to the elderly at TPQ Khoirul Huda. The elderly's deteriorating physical and mental abilities as well as the limited number of teachers in comparison to the enormous number of participants are the impediments.

**Keywords:** Al-Qur'an Learning, Elderly, Usmani Method

### 1 Introduction

Every human being is obliged to seek knowledge. Seeking knowledge is not only done at school, but can be done throughout the ages. The concept of lifelong education is learning that continues throughout life, from birth to the end of life, which can be through formal, non-formal or informal education (Isa & Napu, 2020) . In Islam, the obligation to seek knowledge is highly emphasized as stated by the Prophet Muhammad SAW in his hadith "Seek knowledge from the cradle to the grave" (Riza, 2022) .

The obligation to seek knowledge throughout life for Muslims can be carried out by studying the Qur'an. The Qur'an is the last book revealed by Allah SWT to the

Prophet Muhammad SAW containing advice, evidence and rules for Muslims (Adrian, 2020) . All Muslims have an obligation to study the Qur'an in order to understand the contents and guidance contained in this holy book. For those who can read or who stutter but still study the Qur'an, reading it is a form of worship that is rewarded (Adrian, 2020) . Therefore, it is an obligation for all Muslims, even those who are elderly, to learn how to read the Qur'an properly and correctly.

In the context of Qur'an education, one of the widely used Qur'an learning methods is the Usmani method. The Usmani method can be applied to children, adolescents, adults, and the elderly because it is proven to be practical and easy (Bahri, 2010) . The advantages of the Usmani method lie in the focus of discussing tajwid (reading rules), makhorijul huruf (how to pronounce letters correctly), dirayah (in-depth knowledge of the Qur'an) also accompanied by a complete guide (Setyawati et al., 2023) . This method is specifically designed to facilitate easy learning for each age group, making it an effective tool in introducing and deepening the reading of the Qur'an.

Although the Usmani method is widely known, there is a current phenomenon that shows that many elderly people cannot read the Qur'an properly (Daru et al., 2021) . This is an important problem considering that the elderly are a group that has limitations in terms of physical and cognitive. In the elderly, there is a decline in cognitive functions including learning, understanding and attention as well as psychomotor functions which make the elderly's reactions slower (Pranata et al., 2020) . In addition, at their age that is no longer young, they will tend to have difficulty in learning or accepting new things (Sari et al., 2021) . This is exacerbated by the limitations of education in the past which made many of them not get adequate opportunities to study the Qur'an formally at a young age (Sari et al., 2021) .

The current conditions show that the Qur'an learning programs at the Qur'an Education Center (TPQ) are generally more focused on children (Naim & Permana, 2023) . This causes the elderly to often feel that they do not have an adequate place to learn the Qur'an. The lack of educators, media and learning tools for the elderly is also a common problem in Indonesia (Ali et al., 2023) . This results in most of the elderly not getting the opportunity to learn the Qur'an. In fact, most elderly people actually have great motivation to read the Qur'an. This is shown by their participation in various religious activities, such as yasinan, tahlilan, pengajian, istighasah and khatmil Qur'an (Izzah & Hidayatulloh, 2022) .

This condition also occurs at TPQ Khoirul Huda, Blitar Regency, where many elderly people have great motivation to learn the Qur'an, but they face various obstacles in the learning process. This TPQ implements Qur'an learning using the Usmani method with 158 elderly people while the number of children is only 78 people. However, the declining memory of the elderly has an impact on their learning ability to learn the Qur'an. The elderly at this TPQ generally need more time to understand the material compared to children. In addition, the limited learning time, which is only one hour per class with more than 30 elderly people per class, makes the learning outcomes less than optimal. The individual and classical methods used are sometimes not effective enough to overcome the differences in abilities between the elderly, so a more adaptive method is needed (Sari et al., 2021) .

Several previous studies have described the approach to learning the Qur'an, only the focus of the discussion is children and adolescents. Research conducted by (Nadhiroh & Diana, 2021) examined the effectiveness of the Usmani method in children which showed that this method can improve children's understanding of the Qur'an, but there are obstacles in learning focus and inconsistent attendance rates. Another study by (Aprida & Suyadi, 2022) highlighted the importance of starting Qur'an learning early to form a habit of reading and understanding the Qur'an. However, these studies do not specifically discuss learning for the elderly who have different characteristics and learning challenges. Another study that is more relevant to the context of the elderly was conducted by (Sari et al., 2021) providing insight into Qur'an learning methods that are suitable for the elderly, with an adaptive approach to their needs. This study shows that the Anaba method not only supports improving reading skills but also creates an inclusive and motivating learning environment for elderly participants.

Previous studies did not discuss the Usmani method which has specific advantages in teaching tajwid and makharijul huruf systematically for the elderly. Therefore, this study fills the gap in the literature by focusing on the discussion of: 1) the implementation of the Usmani method in learning the Qur'an for the elderly at TPQ Khoirul Huda, Blitar Regency and 2) its supporting and inhibiting factors.

## 2 Literature Review

### **Usmani Method.**

The Usmani method is a method that has characteristics and uniqueness that distinguish it from other methods (Bahri, 2010). According to Bahri in his book, the Usmani method is a practical way to study the Qur'an accompanied by practical tajwid, how to write Usmani, pegon, comments, makharijul huruf, and books such as short letter books, fasholatan and other supporting books (Bahri, 2010).

The system in learning with the Usmani method is reading vowels directly without spelling, applying reading with direct tajwid, learning materials are presented progressively from simple to complex, from general to specific, applying a learning system in the form of modules, prioritizing intense reading practice (drill), learning is adjusted to the level of students, assessment is carried out at each meeting, learning is carried out through talaqqi and musyafaqah, and teachers must correct their reading first before teaching (tashih) (Bahri, 2010).

The main objective of studying the Qur'an with the Uthmani method is so that students are able to read it accurately and fluently and comply with the norms of Tajweed (Bahri, 2010). In this method there is no time limit specified to complete the learning, so that students can complete it according to their respective abilities. For those who have completed (khatam) a volume, they can continue to the next volume (Bahri, 2010).

### **Elderly in Al-Quran Learning.**

Learning in the elderly tends to be different compared to children. Learning in children is done through the process of identification and imitation, while learning in the elderly is done by directing oneself to solve problems (Suprijanto, 2009). Learning in the elderly is called andragogy, this term comes from the word *andros* which means adult and *agogos* which means to lead, guide or care for (Almaidah, 2020).

Considering that there are many elderly people who cannot read the Koran in tartil and some are even illiterate in Arabic, it is very important for them to study the Koran. Supporting factors for elderly people in learning the Qur'an include 1) strong internal motivation, 2) strategic learning location, 3) supportive community environment, 4) adding positive activities, 5) some elderly people are good at reading the Qur'an 'nya, and 6) strong enthusiasm and effort within oneself to learn the Qur'an (Syarifuddin et al., 2021). Meanwhile, factors inhibiting the elderly in learning the Koran: 1) physical changes, such as frequent illness, blurred vision, and not being able to read makhraj correctly due to missing teeth 2) brain aging, and 3) cognitive changes, such as decreased intelligence, processing ability and memory (Thahir, 2022).

## **3 Method**

This study uses a qualitative approach with a case study type. The researcher acts as the main tool in a qualitative approach to objects in their natural environment. While the case study is used because this study examines a specific case in Nata's current life. In this case study, the researcher focuses on an in-depth analysis of the phenomena that occur in the elderly at TPQ Khoirul Huda, especially in the context of its application and supporting and inhibiting factors. The location of the study is at TPQ Khoirul Huda, Sidodadi Village, Blitar. This location was chosen because there is Al-Qur'an learning for the elderly using the Usmani method, a strategic location for the elderly, and a greater number of elderly students, 153 compared to child students, which is only 78 children. While the informants in this study were a cleric with the initials A as a teacher and ten elderly mothers aged 60-72 years with the initials B, C, D, E, F, G, H, I, J, and K.

Data collection techniques used 1) observation, passive, namely the researcher is only present without being involved in the activities being studied, the researcher observes the process of implementing the Usmani method in learning the Qur'an for the elderly at TPQ Khoirul Huda, 2) interviews, conducted with informant A regarding the background of TPQ Khoirul Huda, the number of participants and the process of learning the Qur'an for the elderly, as well as interviews with ten elderly people regarding their supporting and inhibiting factors in learning the Qur'an 3) documentation, conducted by collecting documents such as teacher's handbooks, bound books, attendance books, and photos of the implementation of learning.

Meanwhile, the data was analyzed using the Miles, Huberman, and Saldana model, namely 1) data reduction, by summarizing and selecting important information, 2) data presentation, using tables so that the data is organized, 3) data verification, aimed

at ensuring the truth of research findings by comparing data with other data, and 4) drawing conclusions.

4 Results and Discussion

4.1 Results

Based on an interview conducted with informant A as a teacher, the schedule for learning the Qur'an for the elderly using the Usmani method at TPQ Khoirul Huda is carried out on Wednesdays and Thursdays, and there is interpretation learning every Saturday which is carried out in turns at the participant's home. There are five TPQ Khoirul Huda Qur'an learning classes based on their ability level or volume. Each class gets a one-hour learning schedule starting with the elderly women's class at 13.30 WIB to 17.30 WIB, then continued with the elderly men's class after the Maghrib prayer. In its implementation, there are three activities carried out in learning the Qur'an using the Usmani method, namely the opening, core activities and closing.

According to observations, the opening stage was carried out by informant A, who conditioned the elderly to be ready to learn, starting by greeting them, reading the fatihah hadroh together with the elderly, praying before studying, then informant A conducted apperception or created a calm and positive atmosphere and repeated the materials that had been taught previously to strengthen the elderly's understanding.

Then the core activity was carried out with informant A conveying the learning objectives in volume 1, namely so that students can listen, differentiate and pronounce the hijaiyah letters with the fathah movement starting from the letter hamzah to ya', students can read three letters in one reading section well and fluently, and can read the hijaiyah letters and Arabic numbers from 1 to 992. Then the concept was instilled, informant A explained the new lesson material using teaching aids and provided examples and encouraged participants to understand:

Table 1. New material volume 1 in concept instillation

| Subject | Material                             |
|---------|--------------------------------------|
| ق ف     | This one reads FA. This one reads QO |
| ك       | This one reads KA. This one reads LA |
| م       | This one reads MA. This one reads NA |
| و       | This one reads WA. This one reads HA |
| ي ء     | This one reads A. This one reads YA  |

The method used is the Usmani method which combines three approaches, namely riwayat, dirayah and practical learning to read the Koran. Riwayah or purely done by learning directly so that the reading of the Al-Qur'an is correct. Dirayah is a way of reading the Koran according to the rules, namely paying attention to tajwid, its nature and makhraj. Practical reading of the Al-Qur'an is a technique developed by Abu Najibullah Saiful Bahri to make it easier for all groups to study the Al-Qur'an. Meanwhile, the media used at TPQ include the Usmani Al-Qur'an manuscripts, guidebooks or learning modules, whiteboards, teaching aids and stationery.

Next, understanding is doing exercises in groups. After that, skills are carried out, namely doing exercises in groups or independently to measure the elderly's ability to read with the talaqqi method, where informant A directly corrects the elderly's reading.

After all participants have finished reciting the Koran, it ends with a closing. Informant A conveys a moral message and motivation for mothers and the elderly. Then it is continued by reading the closing prayer together and closed with greetings.

Then, based on the interviews conducted by the researcher with ten elderly informants, it was found that the supporting factor for the elderly in studying the Qur'an was that they had great motivation in studying the Qur'an. The high motivation of the elderly was driven by their desire to improve the quality of their worship, a strong desire to be able to read the Qur'an with tartil, prepare themselves for the afterlife, and fill their free time with useful activities. The elderly tried to be consistent in studying the Qur'an even though their learning progress was slow. Informants B and C had jobs such as guarding a shop, D, E, F selling at the market, G, H working in the fields, but they still took the time to be able to attend the Koran reading activities at TPQ Khoirul Huda. In addition, there was support provided by family and friends and the strategic location of the TPQ and close to the elderly's house made it easier for the elderly to access.

The inhibiting factors experienced by the elderly based on interviews were that they complained about their blurred vision which resulted in their lack of focus in paying attention to the teaching aids or the whiteboard used by informant A in front of the class. Six out of ten elderly complained of decreased hearing function and seven elderly had missing teeth which resulted in decreased ability to pronounce the hijaiyah letters and tajwid properly and correctly. The ten elderly also experienced decreased memory where their memory decreased, so repeated learning was needed to remember and understand the makharijul letters and tajwid. In addition, the number of teachers in the elderly class at TPQ Khoirul Huda, which was only one person, namely informant A, made it difficult for him to provide truly special attention to elderly individuals. A personal approach was difficult for informant A to do in each class because the average number of participants in one class was 30 people with limited time.

## 4.2 Discussion

Based on the research results, the application of the Usmani method in learning the Qur'an for the elderly at TPQ Khoirul Huda, Blitar Regency showed high effectiveness even though there were inhibiting factors. The three main stages in learning, namely opening, core activities and closing, succeeded in creating a structured and adaptive learning process for the elderly. The elderly showed progress in reading the Qur'an, although at varying speeds. This statement is consistent with research on the anaba technique for the elderly by (Sari et al., 2021) which shows the importance of an adaptive approach to the needs of the elderly. In this context, the Usmani method at TPQ Khoirul Huda adds a systematic dimension and focuses on tajwid and makharijul huruf which enriches the elderly's learning approach.

The learning stages applied in TPQ Khoirul Huda are in line with the guidebook written by Bahri. The book contains steps to facilitate the process of learning the Qur'an directly or specifically. TPQ Khoirul Huda applies specific steps, namely (1) opening with greetings, presenting hadroh fatihah, praying before learning and apperception or repeating previous materials to strengthen participant understanding, (2) core activities are carried out by the teacher conveying learning objectives, delivering new materials and providing examples and encouraging students to understand the lesson, carrying out understanding or exercises in groups, then carrying out exercises in groups or individually to assess students' reading abilities (3) closing is carried out by the teacher conveying motivation to students, the teacher and students end with prayer, then closing with greetings (Bahri, 2010) .

Elderly (senior age) is an age group that is in the last span of life, where old age generally starts from the age of 60 years and above (Hurlock, 1993) . According to Quatelemen, old age starts from the age of 60 to 65 years with the characteristic of the body losing a lot of energy needed for survival (Fahlevi et al., 2023) . According to Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 13 of 1998 concerning the Welfare of the Elderly, a person who is 60 years of age or older is considered elderly (Suadirman, 2010) .

In the learning process, the elderly show characteristics that they experience such as decreased cognitive and physical function. In the elderly, there is a decrease in cognitive function such as decreased memory, attention and thinking speed (Hurlock, 1993) . This affects the ability of the elderly to learn something new, such as reading the Qur'an. Therefore, compared to younger age groups, the elderly need more time to understand and master learning materials due to decreased cognitive and physical abilities. (Pranata et al., 2020) .

At TPQ Khoirul Huda, the elderly also experience a decline in physical function such as blurred vision which results in their lack of focus in paying attention to teaching aids and the whiteboard used in front of the class. In addition, the elderly also experience a decline in hearing function which makes them slow in learning. Furthermore, the elderly's teeth that have fallen out a lot have resulted in a decrease in their ability to pronounce the hijaiyah letters and tajweed according to sharia. The schedule of activities for the elderly who are still working also often makes them physically exhausted so that they are less able to concentrate on learning. This statement is in line with previous research by (Nadhiroh & Diana, 2021) which highlighted the effectiveness of the Usmani method on children can help them become proficient in reading the Qur'an, but with the main obstacle being the lack of focus of the children. Meanwhile, the current study shows that the Usmani method is also effective in being applied to the elderly but with different challenges, namely a decrease in the physical and cognitive function of the elderly.

Despite physical and cognitive limitations, the elderly generally have high motivation to study the Qur'an. This motivation is often rooted in a strong spiritual drive to get closer to God (Almaidah, 2020) . Studying the Qur'an is seen by the elderly as a way of worship and preparing for the afterlife. The elderly are also more motivated to improve their reading of the Qur'an when they participate in activities such as ya-

sinan, tahlilan, and pengajian. The desire of the elderly to study the Qur'an can be encouraged by an appropriate and adequate environment, facilities, and infrastructure.

## 5 Conclusion

Based on the findings and discussions, it can be concluded that the implementation of learning the Qur'an using the Usmani method for the elderly at TPQ Khoirul Huda is carried out on Wednesdays and Thursdays with five classes adjusted to the volume being studied. In the learning process, teachers at this TPQ apply specific steps to teach the elderly. These specific steps are by (1) opening, starting with greetings, reciting hadroh fatimah together, praying to start learning and doing apperception or repeating previous material, (2) core activities, carried out by conveying learning objectives, continued with providing new material, after which the elderly are given the opportunity to practice, then an assessment is carried out using the talaqqi method, (3) closing, the ustadz delivers a moral message or motivation to the elderly to be active in studying the Qur'an, then praying and ending with greetings.

Supporting factors felt by the elderly in learning the Qur'an at TPQ Khoirul Huda include the elderly's high motivation to learn, a supportive family and community environment, and a strategic TPQ location. Meanwhile, inhibiting factors for the elderly in learning the Qur'an are due to a decline in physical and cognitive function, as well as the limited number of teachers compared to the very large number of participants.

## References

1. Adrian. (2020). Improving the Ability to Read the Qur'an of the Elderly Through Religious Literacy in the Krajan Tukum Tekung Lumajang Hamlet in 2020. *As-Sunniyyah: Student Scientific Journal* , 1 (1), 1–23. <http://ejournal.inaifas.ac.id/index.php/assunniyyah/article/download/515/364>
2. Ali, M., Wardi, MM, & Aqodiah, A. (2023). Program to Hack Hijaiyah Illiteracy Through Iqra' Guidance and Al-Qur'an Ta'lim for the Elderly. *JMM (Jurnal Masyarakat Mandiri)* , 7 (6), 6169–6182. <https://doi.org/10.31764/jmm.v7i6.18905>
3. Almaidah, N. (2020). Implementation of the Andragogy Approach in Learning the Qur'an for the Elderly at the Nurul Huda Mosque, Sambirejo, Wonosalam, Jombang. *Rabbani: Journal of Islamic Religious Education* , 1 (2), 160–178. <https://doi.org/10.19105/rjpai.v1i2.4112>
4. Aprida, SN, & Suyadi, S. (2022). Implementation of Al-Qur'an Learning on the Development of Religious and Moral Values in Early Childhood. *Jurnal Obsesi: Jurnal Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini* , 6 (4), 2462–2471. <https://doi.org/10.31004/obsesi.v6i4.1959>
5. Bahri, ANS (2010). *Al-Qur'an Teacher Education Guidebook (PGPQ)* . Al-Qur'an Education Institute, Nurul Iman Islamic Boarding School.
6. Daru, MP, Sarjono, J., & Sukari. (2021). Implementation of the Tsaqifa Method in Learning to Read the Qur'an at the Nurul Iman Elderly Islamic Boarding School. *Al 'Ulum Journal of Islamic Education* , 1 (2), 73–82. [https://doi.org/10.31943/jurnal\\_risalah.v4i1.53](https://doi.org/10.31943/jurnal_risalah.v4i1.53)

7. Fahlevi, R., Diwyarthi, NDMS, Anurogo, D., Anwari, M., Herlambang, HA, Hidayati, SA, Nurdahlia, DU, Pramudito, AA, Aji, R., Sulistiyani, & Putri, GA (2023). Gerontology. In N. Sulung (Ed.), *Get Press Indonesia* . Get Press Indonesia.
8. Hurlock, E.B. (1993). *Developmental Psychology: A Life-Span Approach* (RM Sijabat (ed.); Fifth). Erlangga.
9. Isa, AH, & Napu, Y. (2020). *Lifelong Education* . Ideas Publishing.
10. Izzah, AA, & Hidayatulloh, AM (2022). Learning Tahsin Al-Qur'an Jibril Method in Improving Reading Skills in Elderly in Nglebak Village. *Religious Friday: Journal of Community Service* , 3 (2), 65–69. [https://doi.org/10.32764/abdimas\\_agama.v3i2.2885](https://doi.org/10.32764/abdimas_agama.v3i2.2885)
11. Nadhiroh, U., & Diana, RR (2021). Implementation of the Usmani Method in Developing the Ability to Read the Qur'an in Early Childhood. *PESONA PAUD Scientific Journal* , 8 (2), 80–92. <https://doi.org/http://ejournal.unp.ac.id/index.php/paud/index>
12. Naim, MA, & Permana, D. (2023). Assistance in Learning to Read the Qur'an for the Elderly in Nusamangir Kemranjen Banyumas. *Journal of Research and Community Service* , 1 (1), 20–26. <https://doi.org/10.61231/jp2m.v1i1.14>
13. Pranata, L., Indaryati, S., & Fari, AI (2020). Assisting the Elderly in Improving Cognitive Function with the Brain Gymnastics Method. *Madaniyah Journal* , 1 (4), 172–176. <https://madaniya.pustaka.my.id/journals/contents/article/view/33>
14. Riza, S. (2022). The concept of lifelong Islamic education. *Tarbiyatul Aulad: Scientific Journal of Children's Education* , 8 (01), 13–32. <https://mail.ojs.serambimekkah.ac.id/AULAD/article/view/4674/3433#>
15. Sari, WA, Syamsuddin, & Hidayati, IN (2021). Implementation of the Anaba Method in Al-Qur'an Learning: A Study of Elderly Recitation in Pajang Surakarta. *Al 'Ulum Journal of Islamic Education* , 1 (2), 107–118. <https://doi.org/10.33087/jiubj.v17i3.403>
16. Setyawati, DP, Hartono, D., Meliawaty, & Handayani, DF (2023). Training and Mentoring in Reading the Qur'an Using the Ottoman Method in Order to Eradicate Arabic Illiteracy in Elderly Mothers in Serua Poncol Village, Ciputat, South Tangerang, Banten. *Bakti Mulya: Journal of Community Service and Mentoring* , 01 (01), 28–36. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.59166/baktimulya.v1i1.98>
17. Suadirman, SP (2010). *Psychology of the Elderly* . Gadjah Mada University Press.
18. Suprijanto. (2009). *Adult Education From Theory to Application* . PT. Bumi Aksara.
19. Syarifuddin, Rizqa Hidayati, Munawarah, Norlaila, & Nor Hidayah. (2021). Guidance on Reading the Qur'an to the Elderly in Tambalang Village by KKN Students of the 2021 Amuntai Al-Quran College of Sciences (STIQ). *PaKMas: Journal of Community Service* , 1 (1), 01–07. <https://doi.org/10.54259/pakmas.v1i1.20>
20. Thahir, A. (2022). *Developmental Psychology: Understanding Human Growth and Development from the Prenatal Phase to the End of Life Equipped with Developmental Theories* (I, Vol. 11). Reference Library. [http://scioteca.caf.com/bitstream/handle/123456789/1091/RED2017-Eng-8ene.pdf?sequence=12&isAllowed=y%0Ahttp://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.regsciurbeco.2008.06.005%0Ahttps://www.researchgate.net/publication/305320484\\_SISTEM\\_PEMBETUNGAN\\_TERPUSAT\\_STRATEGI\\_MELESTARI](http://scioteca.caf.com/bitstream/handle/123456789/1091/RED2017-Eng-8ene.pdf?sequence=12&isAllowed=y%0Ahttp://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.regsciurbeco.2008.06.005%0Ahttps://www.researchgate.net/publication/305320484_SISTEM_PEMBETUNGAN_TERPUSAT_STRATEGI_MELESTARI)