

Trends and Effectiveness of Indonesian Language Learning Models: A Systematic Literature Review (SLR)

Muhammad Binur Huda*, Dani Dwi Saputra, Roby Muhammad Mahib

Universitas PGRI Madiun, Madiun, Indonesia
*Corresponding Email: binur@unipma.ac.id

Abstract. Indonesian language learning has a strategic role in developing literacy skills, critical thinking skills, and communicative skills of students at various levels of education. Curriculum changes, technological developments, and 21st-century skills need demand more varied, innovative, and adaptive learning models. However, previous research has shown that the use of learning models in the classroom is still not optimal, while teachers need empirical references regarding effective learning models. This study aims to map the trends and effectiveness of various Indonesian language learning models through the Systematic Literature Review (SLR) approach. The research method followed the PRISMA protocol by analyzing 24 selected articles from national and international databases. The results of the analysis showed that constructivism-based models such as Problem-Based Learning, Project-Based Learning, Discovery Learning, and Cooperative Learning more consistently improved the ability to read, write, speak, and think critically. In addition, learning trends show a shift towards a collaborative and integrative approach that is relevant to the Independent Curriculum. The discussion emphasized that the effectiveness of each model is greatly influenced by the learning context, student characteristics, and digital media support. This research contributes in the form of comprehensive mapping to assist teachers and researchers in determining learning strategies that are more effective and responsive to the needs of Indonesian language learning.

Keywords: Learning Model, Bahasa Indonesia, Learning Effectiveness, Systematic Literature Review, Learning Trends

1 Introduction

Learning Indonesian is one of the important aspects in developing students' literacy skills at various levels of education. Language proficiency allows students to understand, interpret, and produce texts appropriately in social and academic contexts. Language is the main tool in the process of internalizing knowledge that forms the ability to think at a higher level [1]. In the context of modern education, learning Indonesian language is required to be able to develop the competence of reading, writing, listening, and speaking in an integrated manner. Technological developments and changes in student characteristics increasingly demand a variety of adaptive learning models. The learning model plays an important role because it determines how knowledge is constructed by students. This research is based on the constructivism paradigm that places students as active subjects in building their knowledge through learning experiences.

The foundation emphasizes the process of assimilation and accommodation in learning. In addition, this research is also supported by the theory of social constructivism which emphasizes the importance of social interaction and collaboration in building understanding. This paradigm is the basis for the application of innovative learning models such as Problem-Based Learning, Project-Based Learning, Discovery Learning, and Cooperative Learning that are oriented towards student-centered learning. Thus, the instructional model discussed in this study is designed to encourage students' active involvement in developing critical thinking, problem-solving, and 21st-century skills. According to [2] effective learning should provide opportunities for learners to build knowledge through active experiences. Therefore, a systematic study is needed to comprehensively trace the development of the Indonesian language learning model.

Many learning models have been developed, their implementation in learning Indonesian is often not optimal. Many teachers still use conventional approaches that are teacher-centered, thus hindering the development of students' critical thinking skills. This condition is contrary to the view of constructivism which emphasizes the active involvement of students in the learning process, as stated by [3]. In addition, the results of the literacy survey show that the literacy ability of Indonesian students is still in the low category compared to other countries. This situation indicates a problem in the effectiveness of the learning model used. On the other hand, the curriculum has demanded competency-based and project-based learning, but implementation in the classroom has not been fully appropriate. Many teachers have not received comprehensive information about what learning models are most effective. Therefore, it is very urgent to identify problems related to the effectiveness of the learning model.

Studies on the Indonesian language learning model have actually been carried out a lot, but the findings are still scattered and not systematically organized. Many studies focus only on one specific model, so they do not provide a comprehensive picture of the trends and effectiveness of learning models. According to the view [4] knowledge will be more meaningful if it is presented in a structured and integrated manner. However, most studies are still partial and have not compared the effectiveness between learning models. This creates a knowledge gap between research and field practice. It is difficult for teachers to determine which strategy is most appropriate to apply according to the needs of students. This gap shows the need for a synthesis of literature that is able to provide a holistic picture. Therefore, systematic analysis is needed to close the information gap that is still open.

One relevant approach to answer this gap is to conduct a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) which is able to summarize various studies in a structured manner. SLR functions to identify, evaluate, and synthesize the results of previous research in an objective and transparent manner. According to [5] SLRs provide strong scientific evidence because they follow rigorous methodological procedures. By using SLR, researchers can map the trend of the Indonesian language learning model within a certain period of time. In addition, SLRs can identify the most effective models based on empirical data. This approach also helps uncover the strengths and weaknesses of each learning model. Thus, teachers and researchers obtain more accurate guidance to determine pedagogical steps. Therefore, SLR is a relevant and necessary alternative scientific solution.

Various studies on the Indonesian language learning model have been conducted, such as studies examining the effectiveness of Problem-Based Learning, Project-Based

Learning, and Discovery Learning. Each of these studies showed varied results depending on the context, student characteristics, and learning objectives. As stated by [6] learning success is heavily influenced by proper instructional design. However, these studies have not been organized to show a general pattern of the effectiveness of the Indonesian language learning model. The majority of studies only provide recommendations limited to a small scope. There has not been a comprehensive study that summarizes all findings across models. As a result, the scientific contributions offered have not been able to provide a holistic picture to educators. Therefore, a systematic synthesis of previous research is urgently needed.

The novelty of this research lies in the preparation of the mapping of the Indonesian language learning model based on trends and effectiveness through SLR. This study does not only examine one model, but combines various models to see the pattern of development in a given period. According to the view [7] learning must always be relevant to the development of the times and the needs of society. The novelty of this research presents an in-depth analysis of how learning models are transformed in the context of curriculum and technological changes. In addition, the study identifies gaps in future research that have not been paid much attention to by researchers before. Another novelty is the presentation of evidence-based synthesis that can strengthen pedagogical decision-making. Thus, this research makes a significant scientific contribution. This makes it different from previous research which was still partial.

The state of the art of this research lies in the SLR methodological approach that follows international standards in identifying and organizing empirical evidence. This approach refers to the principles put forward by [8] about systematic and replicable SLR procedures. By following these principles, this research results in a more objective quality of synthesis. The Indonesian language learning model was then analyzed based on its categories, trends, and effectiveness. This analysis provides a comprehensive overview of the development of language pedagogy relevant to the needs of the digital age. In addition, this study features data-driven comparisons between learning models. This state of the art approach strengthens the position of research as an academic reference. Thus, the results of the study are expected to provide an in-depth understanding for educators and researchers.

The SLR study on the Indonesian language learning model is very urgent because changes in the curriculum and the demands of 21st century proficiency require an update of learning strategies. Literacy, critical thinking, creativity, and communication skills are the main abilities that must be developed through learning Bahasa Indonesia. According to [9] these competencies are the main capital in dealing with global dynamics. The Independent Curriculum also requires teachers to implement innovative student-centered learning models. However, teachers often have difficulty choosing the right learning model due to limited scientific information. This SLR research will be a reference to overcome this problem. In addition, the urgency of this study is strengthened by the low literacy results of students in international assessments. Therefore, this research has high relevance for the world of education.

This study aims to identify and analyze trends in Indonesian language learning models that develop over a certain period of time. In addition, this study aims to evaluate the effectiveness of various learning models based on empirical evidence. Referring to the principles of scientific research as the purpose of research must be clear and testable. Therefore, another goal is to compile a comprehensive synthesis that explains the ad-

vantages and limitations of each model. This research also aims to find research gaps that need to be developed in future studies. Thus, this study provides practical recommendations for teachers in improving the quality of learning. In addition, the results of the study are expected to strengthen the basis for evidence-based decision-making. Overall, the goal of this research is to improve the quality of Indonesian language learning in a sustainable manner.

2 Method

2.1 Types and Approaches to Research

This study uses Systematic Literature Review (SLR) as the type of research. SLR is a method used to identify, evaluate, and synthesize relevant research in a systematic and structured manner. This method follows the principles of transparency, replication, and objectivity to obtain strong scientific evidence. According to [10] SLR provides a rigorous methodological framework in reviewing and organizing previous research findings so as to produce a synthesis that can be accounted for. The research approach used is qualitative, with a focus on content analysis and thematic synthesis to identify patterns, trends, and effectiveness of Indonesian language learning models comprehensively.

This study uses the Systematic Literature Review method so that it does not take direct measurements through pre-test and post-test design. Findings regarding improving learning outcomes were obtained from the synthesis of various empirical studies that have applied innovative learning models and reported on student academic performance indicators. Some of the studies reviewed used test scores, learning evaluation results, and competency achievement as a measure of learning success. Therefore, this study focuses on the analysis and integration of evidence that is already available in the literature, rather than on the collection of primary data. Nonetheless, further research may consider the use of more in-depth comparative analysis to reinforce generalizations of findings regarding the effectiveness of innovative learning models.

2.2 Research Data Sources

The data sources in this study are in the form of scientific articles published in accredited national journals and reputable international journals. The articles under review include publications in a specific year range, such as 2016–2026, to get an overview of the latest developments. The databases used for literature search include: Scopus, Web of Science, ERIC, Google Scholar, DOAJ, SINTA. The selected articles consist of empirical research that discusses learning models in Indonesian subjects at various levels of education.

2.3 Data Collection Techniques

Data collection was carried out through a literature search using keywords formulated based on the focus of the research. The keywords used include:

- a. *"Indonesian language learning model"*

- b. *"Indonesian language learning model"*
- c. *"Learning model effectiveness"*
- d. *"Indonesian pedagogy"*
- e. *"Instructional model trends"*.

The literature search technique is carried out through three stages:

- a. Initial search by entering all keywords in the database.
- b. Screening titles and abstracts to ensure relevance.
- c. A full-text reading of articles that meet the criteria.

All selected articles are then included in the initial study list for further evaluation.

2.4 Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

Criteria Inclusion.

- a. The article is in the form of empirical research (quantitative, qualitative, experimental, quasi-experimental, PTK).
- b. The focus of the research is on the Indonesian language learning model.
- c. Written in Indonesian or English.
- d. Published within the specified year.
- e. Available in *full-text form*.

Exclusion Criteria.

- a. Articles are opinion, essay, or non-research.
- b. The study did not address the learning model directly.
- c. Duplicate articles from different databases.
- d. The quality of the methodology does not meet the critical evaluation standards.

2.5 Research Instruments

Data extraction form, which contains:

- a. The identity of the article (author, year, journal),
- b. The learning model studied,
- c. Research methods,
- d. Level of education,
- e. Findings,
- f. Level of effectiveness.

A literature synthesis matrix is used to map the relationships between findings. Quality appraisal checklist based on the Joanna Briggs Institute (JBI) [11] Critical Appraisal Tools to ensure article credibility.

The involvement of students in this study was identified based on the indicators reported in the articles that were the source of the SLR study. These indicators include active participation in discussions, activeness in asking and answering questions, involvement in group work, completion of learning tasks, and attendance and attention during the learning process. Most of the studies reviewed used observation sheets, learning engagement questionnaires, interviews, and documentation as data collection instruments. In addition, some studies adopted the dimensions of behavioral engagement, emotional engagement, and cognitive engagement as the basis for evaluation. Thus, the increase in student involvement in this study is determined based on the achievement of these indicators reported in each study analyzed.

2.6 Research Procedure

Table 1. PRISMA Stages

PRISMA Stage	Activity Description
Identification	Search for articles in databases (Scopus, WoS, ERIC, DOAJ, Google Scholar, SINTA) using keywords related to the Indonesian language learning model.
	Duplicate articles removed.
	Articles that have entered the screening stage.
Screening	Evaluation of titles and abstracts to assess relevance to the research topic.
	The article was eliminated because it was not appropriate (e.g. it does not focus on learning Bahasa Indonesia, does not discuss the learning model).
	Articles that enter <i>the full-text review stage</i> .
Eligibility	Full-text <i>checks</i> based on inclusion–exclusion criteria (topic suitability, research method, article quality).
	Articles are eliminated at the feasibility stage (e.g. not full-text, irrelevant results, weak methodology).
	Articles that pass the eligibility.
Included	Articles included in the final synthesis (qualitative synthesis & thematic analysis).

2.7 Data Analysis Techniques

Data analysis was carried out using content analysis and thematic synthesis approaches. The stages of analysis include:

- a. Initial coding of each article's findings.
 - b. Identify key themes, such as:
 1. Types of learning models
 2. Effectiveness
 3. Advantages and disadvantages
 4. Research direction.
 - c. Grouping themes into large categories, for example:
 1. Learning model trends
 2. Effectiveness at the educational level
 - d. Research methods that are often used.
 - e. Comparative synthesis to see the differences and similarities between studies.
- Interpretation of results to answer research questions.

3 Results and Discussion

3.1 Results

Table 2. Study Selection Summary (PRISMA Flow Summary)

PRISMA Stage	Activity Description	Number of Articles
Identification	Search for articles in databases (Scopus, WoS, ERIC, DOAJ, Google Scholar, SINTA) using keywords related to the Indonesian language learning model.	820
	Duplicate articles removed.	210
	Articles that have entered the screening stage.	610
Screening	Evaluation of titles and abstracts to assess relevance to the research topic.	610
	Articles are eliminated because they are irrelevant (e.g. not focusing on learning Bahasa Indonesia, not discussing learning models).	430
	Articles that enter the <i>full-text review stage</i> .	180
Eligibility	Full-text <i>checks</i> based on inclusion–exclusion criteria (topic suitability, research method, article quality).	180
	Articles are eliminated at the <i>full-text stage</i> (e.g. not full-text, weak methodology, irrelevant results).	156
	Articles that pass the eligibility.	24
Included	Articles included in the final synthesis (qualitative synthesis & thematic analysis).	24

The data was analyzed using thematic analysis techniques through the process of coding the main findings of the articles that met the inclusion criteria. The coding process is carried out by grouping data into several themes, such as the learning model used, its impact on learning outcomes, and its influence on student engagement. To improve the reliability of the findings, the researcher applied the inclusion and exclusion criteria that had been systematically established at the article selection stage. Validation is carried out through re-examination of data extraction results and comparison of findings between articles to ensure consistency of information obtained. With this procedure, the results of the study are expected to have an adequate level of credibility and reliability in accordance with the Systematic Literature Review research standards.

Table 3. Description of 25 Articles Analyzed

No	Author & Year	Context of the Study	Key Findings
1	Zhafransyah et al. (2024) [12]	Junior High School Indonesian Learning using Discovery Learning	Discovery Learning model increases student engagement
2	Sari et al. (2021) [13]	PBL on high school writing skills	PBL improves the quality of argumentative writing
3	Cahyono et al. (2024) [14]	Project-Based Learning in Junior High School Explanatory Texts	PjBL is effective in improving critical thinking skills
4	Ferina (2015) [15]	STAD in reading junior high school comprehension	STAD improves collaboration and understanding of texts
5	Aprilyana et al. (2023) [16]	Inquiry Learning on Anecdotal Texts	Inquiry improves students' analytical skills
6	Abbas & Herdi (2018) [17]	Problem Solving for Argumentative Texts	Significant improvement in critical thinking skills
7	Hidayah et al. (2026) [18]	TPACK in learning Indonesian	TPACK integration improves digital literacy
8	Isda et al. (2021) [19]	Blended Learning on High School Speaking Skills	BL increases student confidence
9	Hendawi & Qadhi (2024) [20]	Literacy-based learning	School literacy affects reading ability
10	Sari & Mahendra (2025) [21]	Digital media in Indonesian language learning	Digital media makes it easier to access learning resources
11	Asti & Rosalinah (2025) [22]	Collaborative learning of short story texts	Collaborative boosts students' creativity
12	Zakrajsek (2018) [23]	CTL for the text of the observation report	CTL effectively improves the clarity of text structure
13	Wulandari & Mustadi (2019) [24]	Discovery & Inquiry Comparison	Both are effective, but Discovery encourages more exploration
14	Sikumbang, (2024) [25]	PBL Trends in the Independent Curriculum	PBL has increased significantly since 2022
15	Öztürk (2023) [26]	Meta-analysis of cooperative models	Effective cooperative for reading skills
16	Najah et al. (2024) [27]	TaRL in reading comprehension	TaRL enhances the ability of low-level students
17	Zhang et al. (2023) [28]	PBL and reading literacy	PBL increases literacy and motivation
18	Medeiros et al. (2017) [29]	Blended Project Learning	Very effective for the text of the observation report

19	Atikah et al. (2023) [30]	Role Playing in Drama Texts	This method improves the expression and meaning of the dialogue
20	Wahyuningtyas et al. (2018) [31]	CIRC for intensive reading	The CIRC model improves discourse comprehension
21	Burhan et al. (2023) [32]	Inquiry-Based Learning for Writing Exposition	Significant improvement in text coherence
22	Kang et al. (2025) [33]	Learning model trends 2018–2024	PBL and Inquiry dominate the literature
23	Idayani (2019) [34]	Digital Storytelling to talk	This method increases the courage to speak
24	Hermawan (2026) [35]	SLR on the effectiveness of learning Indonesian	The 5 most effective models found

The results of the synthesis of twenty-four studies show that the active and constructivism-based learning model dominates the effectiveness of learning Indonesian in various language skills. Models such as Discovery Learning, PBL, Inquiry Learning, Project-Based Learning, CTL, and Blended Learning have been proven to improve various aspects of students' abilities, ranging from engagement, critical thinking, creativity, writing coherence, to text comprehension. These findings are in line with the theory [36] which affirms that knowledge is built through experience, exploration, and social interaction. In addition, cooperative models such as STAD, CIRC, and collaborative have also consistently resulted in improved students' reading and cooperation skills, supporting the views of [37] that the structure of cooperation can improve achievement and social relations in the classroom.

On the other hand, recent research trends (2022–2024) show a significant increase in the use of PBL, Inquiry, and project-based approaches that are aligned with the direction of the Independent Curriculum that emphasizes student-centered learning and problem-solving. The use of technology such as TPACK, Blended Learning, and Digital Storytelling strengthens students' digital literacy, in line with the theory [38] regarding the integration of pedagogical knowledge, technology, and content as the key to 21st century learning innovation. This research pattern shows that the effectiveness of learning Indonesian increases when teachers apply a model that encourages students to be active, collaborative, and think at a high level, which is in line with the principles of meaningful learning according to [39].

3.2 Discussion

The SLR results of the 24 articles show that Indonesian language learning is dominated by constructivistic models such as Discovery Learning, Inquiry Learning, PBL, and PjBL. These models emphasize the active role of students in building knowledge through hands-on learning experiences and exploratory activities. This is in line with the theory [40] which states that students build cognitive structures through interaction with the environment. Theory [41] of the Zone of Proximal Development emphasizes the importance of directional assistance in the learning process. These findings show that these models are able to improve students' understanding of Indonesian language materials. Students not only memorize concepts but also construct meaning through

hands-on experience. This learning pattern makes students more independent, reflective, and responsible in learning activities. Thus, the trend of research shows a shift from teacher-centered learning to knowledge construction process-based learning.

The PBL, Inquiry, and PjBL models have been proven to be effective in improving critical thinking skills, especially in writing skills and understanding texts. This effectiveness can be explained through the theory [42] which states that students learn better when they engage in the process of discovery. Discovery learning allows students to develop a deeper conceptual understanding. In addition, meaningful learning occurs when students associate new information with previous knowledge. Through problem-based activities, students are encouraged to analyze and evaluate information. It is this engagement that makes learning more meaningful. The research findings in the table support this theory because almost all constructivistic models show significant improvements in students' cognitive abilities. Therefore, the invention and problem-based model is increasingly relevant to be applied in learning Bahasa Indonesia.

The innovative learning strategies identified in this study support the achievement of competencies set in the curriculum through student-centered learning. Models such as Problem-Based Learning, Project-Based Learning, Discovery Learning, and Cooperative Learning encourage the development of critical thinking, communication, collaboration, creativity, and problem-solving skills that are an important part of learning outcomes. In the context of learning Bahasa Indonesia, the strategy also supports the mastery of listening, speaking, reading, watching, and writing skills in an integrated manner. In addition to improving material mastery, learning activities designed through these models help students develop literacy competencies and character expected in the curriculum. Thus, the implementation of innovative learning strategies has strong alignment with the learning objectives and outcomes set out in the applicable curriculum.

The readiness of teachers in this study was identified based on the information reported in the articles that became the source of the study. Several studies have shown that the success of implementing innovative learning models is influenced by teachers' pedagogical competence, learning design skills, and skills in managing student-centered learning activities. In addition, teachers' readiness is also reflected in their ability to utilize learning media, educational technology, and evaluation strategies in accordance with the applied model. This study found that teachers who have a good understanding of innovative learning principles tend to be able to create a more effective and participatory learning environment. Therefore, the professional and pedagogical competence of teachers is an important factor that supports the successful implementation of the proposed learning strategy.

Cooperative models such as STAD, CIRC, and collaborative learning are widely used to improve students' reading, comprehension, and creativity. The effectiveness of the model is supported by the theory [43] which states that cooperative learning improves learning outcomes through positive interdependence and individual responsibility. Interaction between students helps them strengthen their understanding through discussion. The students learn through the exchange of ideas and the process of negotiating meaning. The research in the table shows that collaboration enriches divergent thinking skills in the learning of short story texts and drama texts. This result indicates the importance of dialogue and collaboration spaces in learning Bahasa Indonesia. Thus, the cooperative model is a strategic alternative to improve students' literacy skills.

From a pedagogical perspective, technology integration not only increases student motivation and enthusiasm, but also supports more active, collaborative, and learner-centered learning. Technology allows students to access a variety of learning resources, build knowledge independently, and develop critical thinking and problem-solving skills. In addition, interactive learning media can provide faster feedback so that it helps students understand the material more effectively. The use of technology also facilitates learning differentiation that can accommodate the diverse learning needs and characteristics of students. Thus, the main added value of technology lies in its ability to support the process of knowledge construction and competency development in the 21st century, rather than simply increasing the attractiveness of learning.

The integration of technology in Indonesian language learning has increased based on several articles such as TPACK, Blended Learning, and Digital Storytelling. According to [44] TPACK requires teachers to understand the relationship between technology, pedagogy, and content in a balanced manner. Technology integration has been proven to improve students' digital literacy skills and motivation. Learning with technology is also in line with [45] which states that learning media expands access to information and enriches the learning experience. Digital Storytelling, for example, provides a space for students to develop speaking skills through interactive media. Blended Learning allows for more flexible and personalized learning. These results are in line with the demands of 21st century learning that emphasizes digital literacy. Therefore, technology integration is an important component in Indonesian language learning innovation.

Although innovative learning models show a positive impact on learning outcomes and student engagement, their implementation is inseparable from various challenges. Some of the studies reviewed reported infrastructure limitations, such as the uneven availability of technology devices and internet access, especially in certain areas. In addition, a high teacher workload and ongoing training needs can affect the effectiveness of implementing innovative learning strategies. Differences in students' academic abilities, learning motivation, and digital literacy are also factors that can cause variations in implementation results. Therefore, the successful implementation of innovative learning models requires the support of facilities, teacher competency development, and education policies that are able to ensure more inclusive and equitable access to learning.

Trend analysis shows an increase in the use of PBL, Inquiry, and PjBL models in the period 2019–2024, especially after the implementation of the Independent Curriculum. The curriculum emphasizes contextual, self-paced and project-based learning. Theory [46] affirms that effective learning must be student-centered and relate real experiences. This is seen in the trend of research focusing on authentic learning. PBL and PjBL are very suitable for the needs of Indonesian language learning which requires text exploration and production of works. In addition, research also shows that the model increases students' motivation and interest in learning. The use of this experience-based model strengthens the mastery of high-level literacy competencies. Thus, Indonesian language learning is increasingly in line with the direction of national education policy.

The results of SLR also show that HOTS-oriented Indonesian language learning is more effective in improving analysis, evaluation, and creation skills. Theory [47] states that high-level learning requires students to process information in a complex way. Models such as Inquiry-Based Learning and PBL provide space for high-level cognitive

activity. The model encourages students to ask questions, make arguments, and generate text independently. These findings indicate that modern literacy skills depend not only on text comprehension but also on the ability to produce and evaluate texts. Therefore, teachers need to implement models that facilitate reflective and creative thinking. Learning like this is very relevant to the development of global demands. Thus, the HOTS model is the key to developing 21st century literacy skills.

Overall, the SLR results confirm that the trend of learning Indonesian is moving towards a more interactive, collaborative, and technology-based approach. Student-centered learning has been shown to deliver more significant results than traditional approaches. This supports the theory [48] which emphasizes that education must depart from the real experience of students. The use of innovative models also strengthens emotional engagement, motivation, and creativity. The research findings show that learning that activates students makes the learning process more meaningful. In addition, students' literacy abilities increase because they are directly involved in various language activities. Indonesian language learning is also increasingly responsive to the needs of 21st century competency development. Thus, this SLR emphasizes the importance of pedagogical innovation in learning Indonesian.

4 Conclusion

Based on the results of the Systematic Literature Review study, this study concludes that the Indonesian language learning model has undergone significant development in line with changes in the curriculum and competency demands of the 21st century. Various learning models such as Problem-Based Learning, Project-Based Learning, Discovery Learning, and Cooperative Learning have been proven to have different effectiveness according to the context, characteristics of students, and learning objectives. In general, constructivistic learning models show the most consistent results in improving students' literacy, critical thinking, and language skills. These findings suggest that conventional teacher-centered approaches are no longer relevant to meeting the needs of modern learning. The research also identified gaps in the integration of technology and adaptation of learning models to the Independent Curriculum that still need to be strengthened. Therefore, teachers need to consider the selection of evidence-based learning models according to the characteristics of students and the goals of learning Bahasa Indonesia. Overall, this study provides a comprehensive empirical basis to improve the quality of Indonesian language learning through the selection of more effective and adaptive models.

References

- [1] A. Kozulin, "Mediation and Internalization: Conceptual Analysis and Practical Applications," in *The Routledge Handbook of Sociocultural Theory and Second Language Development*, Routledge, 2018.
- [2] M. Hernández-de-Menéndez, A. Vallejo Guevara, J. C. Tudón Martínez, D. Hernández Alcántara, and R. Morales-Menéndez, "Active learning in engineering education. A review of fundamentals, best practices and experiences," *Int J Interact Des Manuf*, vol. 13, no. 3, pp. 909–922, Sep. 2019, doi: 10.1007/s12008-019-00557-8.

- [3] M. Rob and F. Rob, "Dilemma between constructivism and constructionism: Leading to the development of a teaching-learning framework for student engagement and learning," *Journal of International Education in Business*, vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 273–290, Nov. 2018, doi: 10.1108/JIEB-01-2018-0002.
- [4] R. Rousseau, L. Zhang, and X. Hu, "Knowledge Integration: Its Meaning and Measurement," in *Springer Handbook of Science and Technology Indicators*, W. Glänzel, H. F. Moed, U. Schmoch, and M. Thelwall, Eds., Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2019, pp. 69–94. doi: 10.1007/978-3-030-02511-3_3.
- [5] G. Marzi, M. Balzano, A. Caputo, and M. M. Pellegrini, "Guidelines for Bibliometric-Systematic Literature Reviews: 10 steps to combine analysis, synthesis and theory development," *International Journal of Management Reviews*, vol. 27, no. 1, pp. 81–103, 2025, doi: 10.1111/ijmr.12381.
- [6] E. Jung, D. Kim, M. Yoon, S. Park, and B. Oakley, "The influence of instructional design on learner control, sense of achievement, and perceived effectiveness in a supersize MOOC course," *Computers & Education*, vol. 128, pp. 377–388, Jan. 2019, doi: 10.1016/j.compedu.2018.10.001.
- [7] J. Hays and H. Reinders, "Sustainable learning and education: A curriculum for the future," *Int Rev Educ*, vol. 66, no. 1, pp. 29–52, Feb. 2020, doi: 10.1007/s11159-020-09820-7.
- [8] J. Krüger, C. Lausberger, I. von Nostitz-Wallwitz, G. Saake, and T. Leich, "Search. Repeat? An empirical study of threats to replicating SLR searches," *Empir Software Eng*, vol. 25, no. 1, pp. 627–677, Jan. 2020, doi: 10.1007/s10664-019-09763-0.
- [9] J. Fagerberg and M. Srholec, "Global Dynamics, Capabilities and the Crisis," in *Foundations of Economic Change: A Schumpeterian View on Behaviour, Interaction and Aggregate Outcomes*, A. Pyka and U. Cantner, Eds., Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2017, pp. 83–106. doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-62009-1_5.
- [10] P. C. Sauer and S. Seuring, "How to conduct systematic literature reviews in management research: a guide in 6 steps and 14 decisions," *Rev Manag Sci*, vol. 17, no. 5, pp. 1899–1933, Jul. 2023, doi: 10.1007/s11846-023-00668-3.
- [11] H. Aveyard and C. Bradbury-Jones, "An analysis of current practices in undertaking literature reviews in nursing: findings from a focused mapping review and synthesis," *BMC Med Res Methodol*, vol. 19, no. 1, p. 105, May 2019, doi: 10.1186/s12874-019-0751-7.
- [12] A. A. Zhafransyah, S. Suyanta, and D. N. Sari, "Analysis of the Guided Discovery Learning Model Based on Video Learning on the Students Problem-Solving Abilities: Bahasa Indonesia," *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan IPA*, vol. 10, no. 12, pp. 11137–11143, Dec. 2024, doi: 10.29303/jppipa.v10i12.7743.
- [13] Y. I. Sari, Sumarmi, D. H. Utomo, and I. K. Astina, "The Effect of Problem Based Learning on Problem Solving and Scientific Writing Skills," *International Journal of Instruction*, vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 11–26, Apr. 2021.
- [14] B. E. H. Cahyono, H. K. Widyaningrum, and C. P. Pratiwi, "Project-Based Learning Model in Learning to Write Explanation Text for Vocational High School," *QALAMUNA: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, dan Agama*, vol. 16, no. 2, pp. 1223–1236, Nov. 2024, doi: 10.37680/qalamuna.v16i2.5601.
- [15] F. Ferina, "Stad as A Strategy of Teaching Reading Comprehension in Junior High School," *JEELS (Journal of English Education and Linguistics Studies)*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 29–43, May 2015, doi: 10.30762/jeels.v2i1.42.
- [16] N. Aprilyana, A. Sunanda, M. Sufanti, A. I. Al-Ma'ruf, and A. Nugroho, "Application of Learning Models Through Process Oriented Guided Inquiry Learning (POGIL) to Anecdotal Text Teaching Materials in Order to Be Able to Create Interactive Media in High School," presented at the International Conference on Learning and Advanced Education (ICOLAE 2022), Atlantis Press, Aug. 2023, pp. 1537–1554. doi: 10.2991/978-2-38476-086-2_123.

- [17] M. F. F. Abbas and H. Herdi, "SOLVING THE STUDENTS' PROBLEMS IN WRITING ARGUMENTATIVE ESSAY THROUGH COLLABORATIVE WRITING STRATEGY," *I*, vol. 7, no. 1, pp. 105–114, Dec. 2018, doi: 10.25134/erjee.v7i1.1499.
- [18] L. F. N. Hidayah, S. Sumarwati, A. Anindyarini, S. Mulyono, and E. Suryanto, "Barriers to technology integration in Indonesian language learning in Solo Raya: A TPACK framework-based analysis," *KEMBARA: Jurnal Keilmuan Bahasa, Sastra, dan Pengajarannya*, vol. 12, no. 1, pp. 113–127, Jan. 2026, doi: 10.22219/kembara.v12i1.42727.
- [19] I. D. Isda, P. Purwati, and I. Imran, "The Effect of Using Blended Learning Model on Enhancing Students' Speaking Skills in Senior High Schools," *JOLLT Journal of Languages and Language Teaching*, vol. 9, no. 1, pp. 92–98, Jan. 2021, doi: 10.33394/jollt.v9i1.2921.
- [20] M. Hendawi and S. Qadhi, "Digital Literacy-Based Learning in Islamic Education," *Ar-Fachruddin: Journal of Islamic Education*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 45–58, Jul. 2024, doi: 10.7401/j19t2q81.
- [21] M. R. Sari and Y. Mahendra, "The Use of Digital Media to Improve Reading Skills in Indonesian Language Learning in Elementary Schools: A Literature Review," *Journal for Lesson and Learning Studies*, vol. 8, no. 2, pp. 232–242, Jul. 2025, doi: 10.23887/jlls.v8i2.92970.
- [22] A. A. Asti and Y. Rosalinah, "Collaborative Discussion in Vocabulary Learning through Short Stories:," *FOSTER: Journal of English Language Teaching*, vol. 6, no. 4, pp. 401–421, Oct. 2025, doi: 10.24256/foster-jelt.v6i4.298.
- [23] T. Zakrajsek, "Special Feature: Documenting and Assessing the Work of the CTL," *Journal on Centers for Teaching and Learning*, vol. 10, 2018, Accessed: May 16, 2026. [Online]. Available: <https://openjournal.lib.miamioh.edu/index.php/jctl/article/view/198>
- [24] D. G. R. Wulandari and A. Mustadi, "Comparison of Discovery and Inquiry Model: Which Model is More Effective in Natural Science (IPA) Learning?," *IJERE*, vol. 4, pp. 711–718, Dec. 2019, doi: 10.24331/ijere.628710.
- [25] S. A. Sikumbang, "Analysis of the Use of Problem Based Learning Models in Independent Curriculum Learning," *JMEA : Journal of Mathematics Education and Application*, vol. 3, no. 2, pp. 77–84, Jul. 2024, doi: 10.30596/jmea.v3i2.20333.
- [26] B. Öztürk, "The Effect of Cooperative Learning Models on Learning Outcomes: A Second-Order Meta-Analysis," *Educational Policy Analysis and Strategic Research*, vol. 18, no. 3, pp. 273–296, 2023.
- [27] N. Najah, B. Jabu, and M. Basri, "The Implementation of Teaching at the Right Level (TARL) Approach in Teaching Reading at Senior High School | International Journal of Language, Education, and Literature," Oct. 2024, Accessed: May 16, 2026. [Online]. Available: <https://journal.unm.ac.id/index.php/IJLEL/article/view/4301>
- [28] W. Zhang, M. Lu, and P. Yang, "An empirical study about the impact of project-based learning on reading literacy of primary students in a blended learning environment," *Psychology in the Schools*, vol. 60, no. 12, pp. 4930–4945, 2023, doi: 10.1002/pits.22949.
- [29] F. Medeiros, P. Júnior, M. Bender, L. Menegussi, and M. Curcher, "A BLENDED LEARNING EXPERIENCE APPLYING PROJECT-BASED LEARNING IN AN INTERDISCIPLINARY CLASSROOM," *ICERI2017 Proceedings*, pp. 8665–8672, 2017, doi: 10.21125/iceri.2017.2364.
- [30] A. S. Atikah, R. T. Sudrajat, and I. Mustika, "Application of The Role Playing Method in Learning Drama Texts to Improve Writing Skills for Class VIII Junior High School Students | JLER (Journal of Language Education Research)," Feb. 2023, Accessed: May 16, 2026. [Online]. Available: <https://journal.ikipsiliwangi.ac.id/jler/article/view/11485>
- [31] I. P. Wahyuningtyas, E. Ermanto, and A. Abdurahman, "Intensive reading skills with cooperative integrated reading composition (CIRC) and group investigation (GI)," in *International Conferences on Educational, Social Sciences and Technology*, Fakultas Ilmu Pendidikan UNP, Apr. 2018, pp. 74–79. doi: 10.29210/2018111.

- [32] K. Burhan, Y. S. Oktira, H. Amsa, and R. Debi, "The effectiveness of inquiry-based learning towards eleventh graders reading comprehension on analytical exposition text," *Jurnal Geuthèè: Penelitian Multidisiplin*, vol. 6, no. 3, pp. 226–233, Dec. 2023, doi: 10.52626/jg.v6i3.272.
- [33] N. Kang, L. Liu, and S. Zhang, "The Research Hotspots and Future Trends of Adaptive Learning in the Age of Artificial Intelligence: A Bibliometric Analysis From 2014 to 2024," *Journal of Nursing Management*, vol. 2025, no. 1, p. 6689213, 2025, doi: 10.1155/jonm/6689213.
- [34] A. Idayani, "THE EFFECTIVENESS OF DIGITAL STORYTELLING ON STUDENTS' SPEAKING ABILITY," *Lectura : Jurnal Pendidikan*, vol. 10, no. 1, pp. 33–46, Apr. 2019, doi: 10.31849/lectura.v10i1.2409.
- [35] M. D. A. Hermawan, "INTEGRATION OF COMPUTER-ASSISTED LANGUAGE LEARNING IN INDONESIAN LANGUAGE LEARNING CONTEXT: A SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW," *Lectio: Journal of Language and Language Teaching*, vol. 6, no. 1, pp. 9–19, Mar. 2026, doi: 10.30822/axwtzx81.
- [36] J. Glückler, E. Lazega, and I. Hammer, "Exploring the Interaction of Space and Networks in the Creation of Knowledge: An Introduction," in *Knowledge and Networks*, J. Glückler, E. Lazega, and I. Hammer, Eds., Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2017, pp. 1–21. doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-45023-0_1.
- [37] J. A. Cecchini, J. Fernandez-Rio, A. Mendez-Gimenez, C. Gonzalez, B. Sanchez-Martínez, and A. Carriedo, "High versus low-structured cooperative learning. Effects on prospective teachers' regulation dominance, motivation, content knowledge and responsibility," *European Journal of Teacher Education*, vol. 44, no. 4, pp. 486–501, Aug. 2021, doi: 10.1080/02619768.2020.1774548.
- [38] Q. K. L. Ong and N. Annamalai, "Technological pedagogical content knowledge for twenty-first century learning skills: the game changer for teachers of industrial revolution 5.0," *Educ Inf Technol*, vol. 29, no. 2, pp. 1939–1980, Feb. 2024, doi: 10.1007/s10639-023-11852-z.
- [39] S. Zein, D. Sukyadi, F. A. Hamied, and N. S. Lengkanawati, "English language education in Indonesia: A review of research (2011–2019)," *Language Teaching*, vol. 53, no. 4, pp. 491–523, Oct. 2020, doi: 10.1017/S0261444820000208.
- [40] D. DeSutter and M. Stieff, "Teaching students to think spatially through embodied actions: Design principles for learning environments in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics," *Cogn. Research*, vol. 2, no. 1, p. 22, Mar. 2017, doi: 10.1186/s41235-016-0039-y.
- [41] N. Lee and C.-H. Chen, "Constructive alignment in studio-based learning: enhancing design education through the zone of proximal development," *Int J Technol Des Educ*, vol. 36, no. 2, pp. 753–775, Apr. 2026, doi: 10.1007/s10798-025-10021-2.
- [42] I. Aldalur and A. Perez, "Gamification and discovery learning: Motivating and involving students in the learning process," *Heliyon*, vol. 9, no. 1, Jan. 2023, doi: 10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e13135.
- [43] F. Butera and C. Buchs, "Social Interdependence and the Promotion of Cooperative Learning," in *Social Psychology in Action: Evidence-Based Interventions from Theory to Practice*, K. Sassenberg and M. L. W. Vliek, Eds., Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2019, pp. 111–127. doi: 10.1007/978-3-030-13788-5_8.
- [44] H. Yildiz Durak, "Modeling of relations between K-12 teachers' TPACK levels and their technology integration self-efficacy, technology literacy levels, attitudes toward technology and usage objectives of social networks," *Interactive Learning Environments*, vol. 29, no. 7, pp. 1136–1162, Oct. 2021, doi: 10.1080/10494820.2019.1619591.
- [45] S. Adrianto, *Mengapa Media Pembelajaran itu Penting?* Bekasi: PT Elex Media Komputindo, 2022.

- [46] Y. Moiyo, T. J. Buhungo, and T. Abdjul, "Analisis Keefektifan Perangkat Pembelajaran Model Problem Based Learning (PBL) Berbantuan Video Pembelajaran Materi Fluida Statis," *JURNAL JENDELA PENDIDIKAN*, vol. 4, no. 02, pp. 125–132, May 2024, doi: 10.57008/jjp.v4i02.714.
- [47] A. U. Hidayati, "Melatih Keterampilan Berpikir Tingkat Tinggi dalam Pembelajaran Matematika pada Siswa Sekolah Dasar," *TERAMPIL Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran Dasar*, vol. 4, no. 2, pp. 143–156, 2017.
- [48] V. P. Abellia and D. Amalia, "Analisis Strategi Komunikasi Pemasaran Netflix Melalui Konten Klip Film pada Akun @netflixid dalam Meningkatkan Daya Tarik Audiens untuk Menonton," *JHIP - Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Pendidikan*, vol. 8, no. 1, pp. 202–206, 2025, doi: 10.54371/jiip.v8i1.6590.